



ANNUAL PROJECT REPORT 2011

United Nations Development Programme Cambodia NSDP/CMDG Monitoring Support Programme June 2011- December 2015



Project ID & Title: 000787884, NSDP/CMDG Monitoring Support Programme
Duration: 5 years (June 2011-December 2015)
Total Budget: US\$ 4,000,000.00
Implementing Partners/Responsible parties: Ministry of Planning
Country Programme Outcome: Evidence from analytical tools is used to guide policy decisions, planning, and resource allocation at national and sub-national levels to accelerate achievement of CMDGs.

Table of Content

Table of Content.....2
I. Executive summary3
II. Implementation progress4
Capacity Development8
Gender9
Lessons learned9
III. Project implementation challenges.....9
 a. Updated project risks and actions9
 b. Updated project issues and actions 10
IV. Financial status and utilization..... 10

I. Executive summary

The NSDP updated 2009-2013 Mid-Term Review report was prepared in participatory approach with line ministries and development partners. The report and its approach paper for next NSDP had been developed and the report was submitted to Council of Ministers in November for review and approval. In parallel, the annual CMDG report was developed, based on NSDP MTR mainly focusing on progress of implementation of nine Cambodia Millennium Development Goals and its challenges.

The poverty was selected as top priority by MoP to be addressed because it involves with many factors such as nutrition, portable water and sanitation, income, etc., to accurately measure the poverty to reflect the real situation, the re-defining national poverty line was discussed and agreed because it was developed in 1993-1994 without involvement of Government and it was never updated till now. In this regard, poverty discussion paper had been developed.

A generic discussion paper on Monitoring and Evaluation of Development Processes in Cambodia had been developed in various discussions with line ministries and agencies, the latest one on November, 21-22 at Siem Seap. Furthermore, the project organized meeting with MAFF and MRD to learn and assess their current state of M&E.

The CDB questionnaires were revised with expanding to cover district and provincial levels and its key indicators had been expanded to cover economic, social and environmental activities. Moreover, CDB products including poverty scores, CMDG scorecards, economic, social and environmental scorecards and revised commune, district and provincial profiles had been identified. Based on revised CDB, the capacity of subnational staffs from all provincial departments of planning was strengthened on data collection and entry.

There are three household data collection systems, including the proposed family data book of the Commune Database (CDB), the ID-poor system and the Community Based Monitoring System (CBMS), are currently applied in Cambodia which are collecting some overlapped data. To address or improve this situation, the concept paper on integration of household data collection process in Cambodia had been prepared for exploring the concept of integrating the three household data collection system.

Many of the activities in the 2011 work plan were moved to 2012, this could be explained by the facts that the project started in June 2011 only, and thus delay in recruiting project personnel as well as contracting POC recipients to implement the project activities.

Based on the achievements above, the project had drawn the lessons learnt as following:

1. The appropriate work plan should be developed based on actual situation and capacities of MoP.
2. There should be greater flexibility in pursuing the targets, because MoP has many projects to deal with.
3. It is better to have long term project adviser to guide, coach and assist ministry officials to manage and implement their daily jobs effectively, because short term consultant was focusing on output assignment rather than capacity building.
4. The next MTR preparation should be started earlier in order to have sufficient time for long process at Council of Ministers.

II. Implementation progress

PROGRESS TOWARDS PROJECT OUTPUTS

OUTPUT 1: Ministry of Planning and Line Ministries produce evidence based policy decision to fast-track the achievement of lagging NSDP/CMDG targets			
Output Indicators	Baseline (Jan-2011)	Target (Dec-2011)	Current status (Dec-2011)
1.1 M&E systems in MAFF and MRD assessed	No	100%	50%, continue for 2012
1.2 Criteria for quality reports adopted	No	100%	Not done
1.3 Capacity development plan for selected MoP/LM staff adopted	No	100%	Not done, because time constrain. It will be done in 2012
1.4 CMDG-2011 report completed and evaluated	1	100%	Completed
1.5 Communication plan for MTR and CMDG report implemented	-	100%	MoP planned to disseminate it through launching events and dissemination meetings
1.6 Policy dialogue event conducted	-	1	Done, the dialogue focused on new national poverty line development
1.7 Plan to support PBA modality developed	-	1	Conducted PBA clinic in August 2011 and road map developed

Description:

NSDP midterm review report preparation

The preparation of NSDP (updated 2009-2013) MTR report was initially started in March 2011 through the 1st national consultative meeting at Siem Reap, which were attended by 89 participants from 42 Line Ministries and other agencies. Social and economic indicators for measuring progress of a results-based national plan were discussed and identified based on following criteria a) it should be national level indicator, b) it should be outcome indicator, and c) it should be measurable and targetable indicator. Workshop agreed to keep table#27 in chapter 6 of NSDP update 2009-2013 which consisted of 46 indicators because they are outcome indicators.

In June 2011, the 2nd national consultative meeting was held at Siem Reap attended by 67 participants from line ministries and other agencies. Input preparation, identification of indicators and data collection procedures were introduced. The meeting was agreed on way forwards for preparing NSDP MTR as following: a) the results of socio-economic survey will be used for developing proxy indicators to measure good governance, and b) revise indicators in table#1 and 2 in the NSDP update 2009-2013.

06-07 October 2011, Inter-Ministerial Technical Consultative Meeting on 1st draft NSDP MTR was organized at Siem Reap province and presided over by **H.E. Chhay Than**, Senior Minister and Minister of Ministry of Planning (MoP). The meeting was attended by approximately 100 participants from Line Ministries and Other Agencies. Figures, technical terms and meanings were reviewed and discussed and the gaps in the report were defined for further improvement.

20 October 2011, Inter-Ministerial Political Consultative Meeting on 2nd draft NSDP MTR was organized at Cambodiana Hotel and presided over by **H.E Ouk Chay**, Secretary of State of MoP. The meeting was attended by approximately 120 participants from political position persons from line ministries and agencies. Technical terms and its attached meanings were discussed

based on government policy and strategic frameworks.

After a series of consultative meetings, the draft NSDP MTR report had been finalized and submitted to Council of Ministers in November 2011 for further review and approval.

Annual CMDG report-2011 preparation

The preparation of annual CMDG report was based on information of NSDP MTR report. It could be considered as the subordinate report of MTR which was mainly focusing on progress of implementation of nine Cambodia Millennium Development Goals and its challenges.

On 1st November 2011, Inter-Ministerial Consultative Meeting on draft CMDG report was organized at Sihanouk province and presided over by **H.E. Chhay Than**, Senior Minister and Minister of Ministry of Planning. The meeting was attended by approximately 50 participants from MDG Line Ministries and other government agencies. Draft CMDG report was reviewed and discussed which was focusing on technical terms, contents, figures, interpretation and report structure. Based on these value comments, the report had been finalized and published in Dec.

Policy dialogue on one lagging CMDG target

This policy dialogue was to be on a lagging CMDG. The purpose was to arrive at a strategy to succeed in overcoming the impediments and achieve the results.

As per poverty was identified and agreed by Senior Minister of MoP as top priority, so that the poverty measurement should be accurate and met with the actual situations of the country. To do this, the standing committee for new national poverty line identification which consist of MOP, SNEC, MOEF, MOH, MOEY, Academia (Royal Academy of Social Sciences), and the Civil Society, was established by PRAKAS of MoP and met on 21-22 November to dialogue on how to iron out issues in measuring poverty. As results, the group made many suggestions for the new poverty line. It first stated that the earlier poverty line, developed in 1992-93, was too old and required a revision. It, however, also rejected the new approach that the World Bank proposed. The main reason was that it was not done in any consultation with the government. The meeting had assigned sub-group to work on initial calculation and meet again in late January 2012. To help the initial calculation, **Dr. James Knowles**, an expert on poverty, who had made most of the earlier poverty calculations for Cambodia was invited to expose the sub-group on the nuances of poverty measurement for two-day workshop on Dec. 15-16, 2011.

M&E system for MAFF and MRD

A generic discussion paper on Monitoring and Evaluation of Development Processes in Cambodia had been developed in various discussions with line ministries and agencies, the latest one on November, 21-22 at Siem Seap. The paper was focusing on four parts of M&E including a). Macro level indicators were on outcome and impact, b). Ministry level indicators were on output and input, c). Micro level studies of various kinds and explains how they could be useful in the M&E system in the country and d). Make a case for strengthening the database and synchronising definitions of variables.

20 December 2011, meeting with MAFF and MRD with total 20 participants was organized. The meeting was quite involving, and also entailed each of the ministries to present its state of M&E. The key findings are as below:

- a. Both MAFF and MRD possess basic administrative structures for collecting data on performance. In fact, MRD has tried to replicate the MAFF structure. The quality of the reporting, however, varies.
- b. MAFF has a fairly detailed data collecting system, and has outlets at the province and district levels. MRD has much less. This needs beefing up.
- c. MAFF is not sure whether the data generation process and the quality of data collected are the same across all the provinces and districts. It is, however, sure that it lacks in human skills and resources. Moreover, it is sure that the data on different items like rice agriculture, other crops, and non-crop agriculture are dis-similarly collected across the country. This is a lacuna, and needs correction.

- d. In MRD, ADB has provided assistance for strengthening the M&E System. However, the administrative structures are still nascent or non-existent at the sub-national levels. Many times, financial audit is the only means by which progress reporting is done at the sub-national level.
- e. Both human capacities and resources are lacking in both the ministries, especially at the sub-national level. This aspect needs urgent attention.
- f. There is a lot of data collected, including micro studies and technical studies conducted on aspects of agriculture, by the MAFF, but much of the data lies unused, for want of a mechanism for dissemination. The quality of these data, while not under question a priori, need scrutiny.
- g. There is lack of uniformity of definitions on the same variables across ministries and departments. A standardisation of variables exercise has to be carried out by NIS under the Statistical Law of Cambodia. It should be noted that the Statistical Law has provisions to do such exercises, but none has been initiated until so far.

Capacity development plan for selected MoP/LM staff

The capacity development plan for selected MoP/LM staff could not be developed in 2011 due to time constrains and the delay in project start-up.

MoP had conducted a Programme Based Approaches (PBA) clinic at Sihanouk province in August 2011 and came up with an indicative implementation roadmap for MoP.

delivery exceeds plan

delivery in line with plan

delivery below plan

OUTPUT 2: National and sub-national plans are fully integrated into five key sectors

Output Indicators	Baseline (Jan-2011)	Target (Dec-2011)	Current status (Dec-2011)
2.1 Two LM willing to participate identified and engaged	No	2	All progress could not be made by this year due to time constrain. So that, it had been shifted to 2012
2.2 Working group established	No	1	
2.3 National/Sub-national workshop conducted	-	1	
2.4 Draft guideline generated	-	1	
Description: The progress could not be made in 2011 due to time constrain, because the startup of project was delay. In this regard, all activities to these output indicators had been moved to implement in 2012.			
<input type="checkbox"/> delivery exceeds plan	<input type="checkbox"/> delivery in line with plan	<input type="checkbox"/> delivery below plan	

OUTPUT 3: CDB based CMDG scorecards and other products are used to focus sub-national planning processes by 194 district/Khans/Municipality

Output Indicators	Baseline (Jan-2011)	Target (Dec-2011)	Current status (Dec-2011)
3.1 CDB working group established	-	1	ToR had been drafted
3.2 Products identifies	yes	4	Done
3.3 Questionnaire revised	yes	1	Done
3.4 Software modified and training conducted	yes	1	Done
3.5 Data collected according to new formats	-	1	Done
Description: The D&D and Seth Koma working group of Ministry of Planning has reviewed and refined CDB questionnaires and expanded it to cover district and provincial levels through consultative meetings organized with concerned Line Ministries including MRD, MoEYS, Mol, MoH, MoSAVY,			

MoLVT, MoWA and CMAA.

22-23 September 2011, Ministry of Planning organized the National Consultative Workshop on refining CDB questionnaires at Kampong Cham province. The two days long workshop was chaired and led by **H.E Hou Taing Eng**, Secretary of State of Ministry of Planning and attended by approximately 100 participants from all Provincial Department of Planning, different provincial line departments of Kampong Cham, Ministry of Planning, CMAA, UNICEF, and UNDP. The workshop refined, updated and identified core additional questions for district and provincial levels as well in order to have comprehensive information for planning. As results, some questions were shifted around from village to commune/Sangkat and commune/Sangkat to district in order to make it consistent with data sources.

With support of international consultant, the CDB questionnaires had been revised and finalized based on workshop's results and key indicators relating to economic, social and environmental activities for CDB Scorecard expansion had been identified. The revised questionnaires had been tested at subnational levels (district, commune/Sangkat, and village) and the observation on the process and methodologies of data collection and its sustainability had been made. In parallel with revising CDB questionnaires, MoP had also revised and updated CDB data collect guideline accordingly. Besides, the CDB products including poverty scores, CMDG scorecards, economic, social and environmental scorecards and revised commune, district and provincial profiles, had been identified.

CDB is a very important tool for sub-national planning because of its wide-reaching geographical scope, its inclusion of variables relevant to Cambodian Millennium Development goals (CMDG) and the National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP). The data collected by the CDB is summarized annually in Commune, District and Provincial profiles which are used by sub-national authorities to prepare periodic Development Plans and Annual Investment Plans, so that the establishment of CDB working group is needed in order to ensure coordination of efforts at improving and using the CDB and ensure broad awareness, understanding and support for the information. In this regard, Term of Reference for CDB Working Group had been drafted and **H.E Hou Taing Eng** will take further consideration about advantages and disadvantages of the Working Group.

CDB-Software had been modified based on the new revised questionnaires and indicators with assistance of IT specialist of NCDD. Based on modified software; 110 participants from all provincial departments of planning, which were trained for three days long on 15-17 December 2011 on how to operate data entry, clearly understand the data entry management and are able to enter data effectively.

There are three household data collection systems in Cambodia including the proposed family data book of the Commune Database (CDB), the ID-poor system and the Community Based Monitoring System (CBMS) currently piloted in a dozen communes in Cambodia. While there are other systems that collect information at the household level in sample or census form, for example the annual Cambodia Socio-Economic Survey (CSES), the Cambodia Demographic and Health Survey (CDHS) and the Census itself, these are not examined in this paper. To address or improve this situation, the concept paper on integration of household data collection process in Cambodia had been prepared for exploring the concept of integrating household data collection system. It is however felt that the proposed integration, if it is successful, will have an impact on the design and delivery of these instruments, which will need to be considered in a follow-up assessment.

<input type="checkbox"/> delivery exceeds plan	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> delivery in line with plan	<input type="checkbox"/> delivery below plan
--	--	--

PROGRESS TOWARDS COUNTRY PROGRAMME (CPAP) OUTPUT

OUTPUT: Evidence from analytical tools is used to guide policy decisions, planning, and resource allocation at national and sub-national levels to

accelerate achievement of CMDGs.

Output Indicators	<i>Baseline (Jan/2011)</i>	<i>Target (Dec/2011)</i>	<i>Current status (Dec/2011)</i>
Lagging NSDP/CMDG targets identified, agreed and approved in the NSDP MTR (Sept 2011) by MoP	No	1	Done
Concept note for policy dialogue developed for one selected lagging behind NSDP/CMDG target	No	1	Done

Description:

Initial discussions at the Ministry of Planning (both GDP and NIS) suggested that poverty is an issue of top priority: not only did the government attach high priority to its redress, also that with better incomes people can access health, education, etc. and meet the other CMDGs. It was also seen that nutrition, a part of CMDG1, was hugely affected by non-availability of potable water and sanitation, and if addressed, poverty would definitely be dented.

The early meetings were followed by discussions in the TWG on Poverty (August 2011), and then with the Senior Minister of MoP; he emphasised the need to address poverty on top priority. The poverty issue was discussed with a formal meeting that the Senior Minister along with all the Secretaries of State and DGs, convened on October 11, 2011, was decided to concentrate on poverty issues, i.e. CMDG1. In this regard, the concept note for poverty measurement in Cambodia which is relating to the selection of nutrition norm, food and non-food items and methods to be used was developed.

PROGRESS TOWARDS COUNTRY PROGRAMME (CPAP) OUTCOME

OUTCOME: Enhanced capacities at national and sub-national levels to develop and monitor policies, plans and budgets that are evidence-based and geared towards the attainment of the MDGs by 2015

Outcome Indicators	<i>Baseline (Jan/2010)</i>	<i>Target (Dec/2010)</i>	<i>Current status (Dec/2010)</i>
A policy dialogue on one lagging NSDP/CMDG target held in collaboration with MoP	No	1	Done

Description:

The dialogue on new national poverty line led/facilitated by MoP was held at Siem Reap on 21-22 November 2011 and attended by all national poverty line committee members which consist of MOP, SNEC, MEF, MOEF, MOH, MOEY, Academia (Royal Academy of Social Sciences), and the Civil Society. Since there is consensus on redefining poverty line, the nutrition norms, food and non-food items and methods were seriously discussed and agreed. Sub-group was assigned to work on calculation based on agreed points of meeting.

Capacity Development

- To increase the capacities, counterpart staffs of NMSP attended the trainings which were organized by UNDP as following: a) Training on the implementation of National Implementation Modality b) Result Based Management on 18-19 October 2011, and c) gender mainstreaming on 15-16 December 2011. All of them were well understood about concepts of result based management and gender mainstreaming and they are transferring the knowledge into practices.
- 15-17 December, 110 participants from all provincial departments of planning were trained on how to operate data entry based on revised CDB software. All participants understand the data entry management and are able to enter data effectively.
- 15-16 December, approximately 20 participants from NIS, GDP and national poverty line committee's members were trained on how to calculate national poverty line which was facilitated by **Dr. James Knowles**, poverty specialist. Participants had received better understandings on how to calculate and adjust the poverty line based on Calories norm, food and non-food items and methodologies.

- On-the-job training had been provided by international consults toward MoP's concerned staffs in order to improve their capacities in term of preparation of NSDP-MTR and CMDG reports, revising CDB questionnaires and indicators and developing profiles for commune, district and province.

Gender

- Counterpart staff under POC recruitment had been recruited in high consideration of gender equity. As result, 2 of 5 officials recruited for project were women, one is project coordinator and other one is project coordinator assistant.
- Participation of women from relevant ministries and agencies was strongly encouraged to join in various consultative meetings or workshops including NSDP MTR, CMDG and Poverty Line to ensure the gender equity.
- NMSF is working in general to monitor and accelerate the progress of NSDP/CMDG implementation. The 9 CMDG goals and its targets had been reviewed and came up with recommendation for further improvement. In this regards, the 3rd goal (promote gender equality and empower women) was showing lagging in some of indicators which need focused attention such as: literacy of adult women, wage employment in the service sector and promotion of women in top decision-making position at all levels.

Lessons learned

1. Delay in approving AWP 2011 affected to its deliverables; so that, some activities of AWP 2011 were slowly implemented and or shifted to 2012. Besides, Government officials have lot of assignments to deal with both inside and outside the ministry. In this regard, the appropriate work plan should be developed based on actual situation and capacities.
2. There are some on-going projects at Ministry of Planning but still limited degree of harmonization among supported DPs. So that, there should be greater flexibility in pursuing the targets.
3. Short term technical consultant was working on output assignments rather than overall capacity building. In this regard, a long term project adviser is preferred to guide, coach and assist ministry officials to manage and implement their daily jobs effectively.
4. The process of NSDP MTR report review and approval is taking sometime at Council of Ministers. In this regard, the next MTR preparation should reserve more times to implement the work plan.

III. Project implementation challenges

a. Updated project risks and actions

Project Risk 1: Delay in submitting inputs from LMs/LAs for NSDP Update 2009-2013 MTR and CMDG report led to be late in producing report as work plan by Ministry of Planning.

Actions taken: For the next NSDP Report and CMDG Report 2012, the MoP shall clearly allocate time in circular and guideline, and strictly implement it with LMs/LAs.

Project Risk 2: Process for approving the NSDP MTR for 2011 at Council of Ministers take time since this year RGC has many urgent agendas (border issues and natural disaster).

Actions taken: The next MTR should be started earlier in order to have sufficient time for the long process at Council of Minister. Besides, closely follow up all meeting sessions and provide responses as needs.

Project Risk 3: Proposed activities for AWP-2012 are more technical, so that it would require experts to be on board as soon as possible to guide and assist Ministry of Planning to deliver it on time based on agreed AWP.

Actions taken: UNDP has to accelerate the process of technical consultant recruitment.

b. Updated project issues and actions

Project Issue 1: There is no travel allowance rate had been set for project. At the meantime, project had been applying UNDP travel allowance rate at \$1 per 10Km. Based on random survey of Taxi cost, project had proposed travel allowance rate at \$0.8 per 10Km and submitted to UNDP for approval.

Actions taken: Project will continue to apply UNDP travel allowance rate at \$1 per 10Km until the new rate has been decided by UNDP.

Project Issue 2: Short term consultants were working on achieving output assignments, rather than capacity building.

Actions taken: UNDP has to recruit long term adviser for project in order to have sufficient time to guide, coach or train and assist MoP officials to implement their jobs effectively.

Project Issue 3: POC was approved in November 2011 and staffs not yet received the payment at the moment, because of waiting for letter of MEF. Moreover, POC will be ended at June 2012 and no new instruction had been made for applying beyond June 2012.

Actions taken: UNDP and MOP need to look for possible approaches to solve the POC issue in order to ensure the sustainability of project beyond June 2012.

IV. Financial status and utilization

Table 1: Contribution overview project (01 Jan 2011 to 31 Dec 2015)

DONOR NAME	CONTRIBUTIONS		CONTRIBUTIO N BALANCE
	Committed	Received	
UNDP	258,000	258,000	-
TOTAL	258,000	258,000	-

Table 2: Annual expenditure by Activity (in Atlas format) [01 Jan 2011 to 31 Dec 2011]

Activity	2011 APPROVED BUDGET	2011 EXPENDITURE	BALANCE	DELIVERY (%)

Activity1 Ministry of Planning and Line Ministries produce evidence based policy decisions to fast-track the achievement of lagging NSDP/CMDG targets	59,594.38	57,614.71	1,979.67	97%
Activity2 National and sub-national plans are fully integrated in five key sectors	-	-	-	-
Activity3 CBD based CMDG scorecards and other products are used to focus sub-national planning processes by 194 districts/khans/ municipality	77,479.79	76,149.50	1,330.29	98.28%
Activity4 Project Management Support	120,925.83	104,335.02	16,590.81	86%
Total	258,000.00	238,099.23	19,900.77	92.29%

Table 3: Cumulative expenditure by Activity (in Atlas format) [01 Jan 2011 to 31 Dec 2015]

Activity	TOTAL PROJECT BUDGET	CUMULATIVE EXPENDITURE	BALANCE	DELIVERY (%)
Activity1 Ministry of Planning and Line Ministries produce evidence based policy decisions to fast-track the achievement of lagging NSDP/CMDG targets	59,594.38	57,614.71	1,979.67	0.97
Activity2 National and sub-national plans are fully integrated in five key sectors	-	-	-	-
Activity3 CBD based CMDG scorecards and other products are used to focus sub-national planning processes by 194 districts/khans/ municipality	77,479.79	76,498.37	981.42	98.73%
Activity4 Project Management Support	120,925.83	118,334.08	2,591.75	98%
Total	258,000.00	252,447.16	5,552.84	97.85%